

Project No.JUST/2010/KPEN/AG/1546 "Possibilities of solution of topical problems of restorative justice in the European Union"

Training course "Recognition, investigation and prevention of human trafficking as an effective tool for the termination of the phenomena"

26-27 September 2013, Riga

National Referral Mechanism

Rhys Hadden
(Barrister, United Kingdom)

Legal Framework

- Purpose of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings ("the Trafficking Convention"):
 - prevent and combat trafficking in human beings
 - protect and assist the victims of trafficking and respect their human rights
 - ensure effective investigation and prosecution of traffickers
 - promote international cooperation to meet these objectives and to secure action against trafficking in human beings

Definition of National Referral Mechanism (NRM)

"A National Referral Mechanism (NRM) is defined as a co-operative framework through which State actors fulfil their obligations to protect and promote the human rights of trafficked persons, co-ordinating their efforts in a strategic partnership with civil society."

p.14, National Referral Mechanisms. Joining Efforts to Protect the Rights of Trafficked Persons. A Practical Handbook (OSCE/ODIHR, 2004)

Aims of an NRM

- Basic aims of an NRM are:
 - ensure that the member State's obligations under the Palermo Protocol and Trafficking Convention are met;
 - work to help improve national policy and procedure on a broad range of victim-related issues
 - establish national plans of action;
 - set benchmarks to assess whether goals are being met;
- Human-rights based approach

The Act of Human Trafficking

- Article 4 of the Trafficking Convention
- Definition broken down into three core elements:
 - 1. the act;
 - 2. the means; and
 - 3. the purpose
- Consent in an adult is rendered irrelevant if they consented in prohibited circumstances
- Children: where the act and the purpose are present, no legal requirement to establish that any of the means were used. A child cannot consent to be trafficked

The Trafficking Convention and Victim Protection

- The principal obligations in the Trafficking Convention in terms of victim protection are:
 - Identification and a commitment that a victim should not be removed from the territory until identification process is complete (Article 10)
 - Assistance for victims (Article 12)
 - Minimum 30 day reflection and recovery period during the two stages of the identification process (Article 13)
 - Residence permits in specified circumstances for identified victims of trafficking (Article 14)
 - Legal assistance and compensation for victims (Article 15)

Partnership in Victim Identification

- Effective NRMs require good cooperation between government agencies and civil society
- Broad range of people and institutions who can identify victims of trafficking, particularly if trained and a system of referral is in place. These can include:
 - law enforcement
 - government agencies
 - NGOs
 - local social welfare organizations
 - hospital staff and psycho-social medical specialists
 - labour unions
 - labour inspections and other labour-related agencies
 - embassy officials

Process of Victim Identification

- Core of NRM to identify presumed trafficked person
- Problem of mistrust of official bodies
- Role of Competent Authority (CA)
 - Article 10 of Trafficking Convention
 - UK has two CAs
 - UK Borders Agency (UKBA)
 - UK Human Trafficking Centre (UKHTC)

First Responders

 NRM envisages that victims will be identified by 'first responders' who can refer to CA to carry out the formal identification process

Adult victim needs to give consent

Designated organisations in the UK

Two Stage Process

- Article 10 creates two-stage process by which decisions by the CA on the identification by of a trafficking victim are made:
 - 1. Reasonable Grounds test
 - Conclusive Decision should be taken in reflection period

Stage One – Reasonable Grounds

- Following referral by First Responder, the CA will apply 'reasonable grounds' test to decide whether a person is a victim of trafficking
- If positive, potential victim of trafficking is granted a minimum 30 day recovery and reflection period (Art.13 of Trafficking Convention)
- Standard of Proof for 'reasonable grounds'
 - Intended to be very low to enable rapid identification and swift assistance to the presumed victim
 - Rantsev v Cyprus and Russia [2010] ECHR 22 at [286]:
 - "...were aware, or ought to have been aware, of circumstances giving rise to a credible suspicion that an identified individual had been, or was at real and immediate risk of being, trafficked or exploited..."
 - UK standard of proof = reasonable suspicion

Stage Two - Conclusive Decision

- Final decision as to whether the potential victim is to be accepted as an actual victim of trafficking.
- Should be taken within reflection and recovery period identified by Art.13
- Standard of proof
 - Trafficking Convention silent on the appropriate standard of proof
 - Complexities in reaching full identification decision
 - UK standard of proof = balance of probabilities
 - Different standard of proof applied in asylum claim

The NRM in the UK

- Operated since 1st April 2009. NRM created by policy, not law
- Not a referral body, identification purposes only
- Perceived failure to use specialist or support bodies to assist in identification
- Lack of awareness in key agencies
 - OOO & Others v Commissioner of Metropolitan Police [2011] EWHC 1246 (QB)
- The report, It Happens Here, Centre for Social Justice, March 2013) recommends:
 - Establish Anti-Slavery Commissioner
 - Creation of Two-Tier NRM (anonymous referral and named referrals)
 - Removal of UKBA as Competent Authority
 - Single training package for First Responders
 - Police to develop links with NGOs, allowing experienced workers to accompany police on visits

Future Developments

- EU Strategy towards the Eradication of Trafficking in Human Beings (2012-2016). Set of practical measures to be implemented over the next five years, based on five key priorities:
 - Identifying, protecting and assisting victims of trafficking;
 - Stepping up the prevention of trafficking in human beings;
 - Increased prosecution of traffickers;
 - Enhanced coordination and cooperation among key actors and policy coherence;
 - Increased knowledge of and effective response to emerging concerns related to all forms of trafficking in human beings.
- Establishment of EU Transnational Referral Mechanism?

Source Materials

- National Referral Mechanisms, Joining Efforts to Protect the Rights of Trafficked Persons: A Practical Handbook (OSCE/ODIHR, 2004)
- Trafficking in Human Beings: Identification of Potential and Presumed Victims, A Community Policing Approach (OSCE, June 2011)
- European Commission website: http://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/
- EU Strategy towards the Eradication of Trafficking in Human Beings (2012-2016)
- GRETA Report on Latvia (January 2013)
- It Happens Here: Equipping the United Kingdom to fight modern slavery, Centre for Social Justice, March 2013